

# 计量经济学中的因果推断：过去、现在与未来

陈强

## [参考文献]

陈强, 齐霁, 颜冠鹏. 断点回归的两大分析框架: 我们究竟该用哪一个. 经济学动态, 2024a(11): 128-144.

陈强, 齐霁, 颜冠鹏. 双重差分法的安慰剂检验: 一个实践的指南. 管理世界, 2025, 即将发表.

陈强, 齐霁, 颜冠鹏. 经济学实证研究中的中介效应分析. 工作论文, 2024b.

刘冲, 沙学康, 张妍. 交错双重差分: 处理效应异质性与估计方法选择. 数量经济技术经济研究, 2022b(9): 1-28.

刘冲, 诸宇灵, 李皓宇. 断点回归设计: 理论前沿进展与新应用场景. 经济学报, 2022a(9): 325-366.

许文立. 双重差分法的最新理论进展与经验研究新趋势. 广东社会科学, 2023(5): 51-62.

张子尧, 黄炜. 事件研究法的实现、问题和拓展. 数量经济技术经济研究, 2023(9): 71-92.

Abadie, A. Semiparametric Difference-in-Differences Estimators. *Review of Economic Studies*, 2005, 72(1): 1-19.

Abadie, A. Using Synthetic Controls: Feasibility, Data Requirements, and Methodological Aspects. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 2021, 59(2): 391-425.

Abadie, A., & Cattaneo, M. Econometric Methods for Program Evaluation. *Annual Review of Economics*, 2018, 10: 465-503.

Abadie, A., Diamond A., & Hainmueller, J. Synthetic Control Methods for Comparative Case Studies: Estimating the Effect of California's Tobacco Control Program. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2010, 105(490): 493-505.

Abadie, A., Diamond A., & Hainmueller, J. Comparative Politics and the Synthetic Control Method. *American Journal of Political Science*, 2015, 59(2): 495-510.

Abadie, A., & Gardeazabal, J. The Economic Costs of Conflict: A Case Study of the Basque Country. *American Economic Review*, 2003, 93(1): 113-132.

Abadie, A., Imbens, G. W. Bias-Corrected Matching Estimators for Average Treatment Effects. *Journal of Business & Economic Statistics*, 2011, 29(1): 1-11.

- Anderson, T. W., & Rubin, H. Estimation of the Parameters of a Single Equation in a Complete System of Stochastic Equations. *Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, 1949, 20 (1): 46-63.
- Andrews, I., Stock, J. H., & Sun, L. Weak Instruments in Instrumental Variables Regression: Theory and Practice. *Annual Review of Economics*, 2019, 11 (1): 727-753.
- Angrist, J. D. Lifetime Earnings and the Vietnam Era Draft Lottery: Evidence from Social Security Administration Records. *American Economic Review*, 1990, 80(3): 313-336.
- Angrist, J., & Krueger, A. Does Compulsory School Attendance Affect Schooling and Earnings? *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 1991, 106(4): 979-1014.
- Angrist, J. D., Lavy, V. Using Maimonides' Rule to Estimate the Effect of Class Size on Scholastic Achievement. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 1999, 144(2): 533-576.
- Angrist, J. D., & Pischke, J. The Credibility Revolution in Empirical Economics: How Better Research Design is Taking the Con out of Econometrics. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2010, 24(2): 3-30.
- Arkhangelsky, D., Athey, S., Hirshberg, D. A., Imbens, G. W., & Wager, S. Synthetic Difference-in-Differences. *American Economic Review*, 2021, 111(12): 4088-4118.
- Ashenfelter, O. Estimating the Effect of Training Programs on Earnings. *Review of Economics and Statistics*, 1978, 60(1): 47-57.
- Athey, S., & Imbens G. Recursive Partitioning for Heterogeneous Causal Effects. *Proceedings of National Academy of Sciences USA*, 2016, 113(27): 7353-7360.
- Bai, J., & Ng, S. Matrix Completion, Counterfactuals, and Factor Analysis of Missing Data. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2021, 116(536): 1746-1763.
- Baker, A. C., Larcker, D. F., & Wang, C. C. Y. How Much Should We Trust Staggered Difference-in-differences Estimates? *Journal of Financial Economics*, 2022, 144(2), 370-395.
- Banerjee, A., Cole, S., Duflo, E., & Linden, L. Remedy Education: Evidence from Two Randomized Experiments in India. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 2007, 122(3): 1235-1264.
- Banerjee, A., & Duflo, E. The Experimental Approach to Development Economics. *Annual Review of Economics*, 2009, 1: 151-178.
- Belloni, A., Chen, D., Chernozhukov, V., & Hansen, C. Sparse Models and Methods for Optimal Instruments with an Application to Eminent Domain. *Econometrica*, 2012, 80(6): 2369-2429.
- Black, S. E. Do Better Schools Matter? Parental Valuation of Elementary Education. *Quarterly*

*Journal of Economics*, 1999, 114(2): 577-599.

Borusyak, K., Jaravel, X., & Spiess, J. Revisiting Event-Study Designs: Robust and Efficient Estimation. *Review of Economic Studies*, 2024, 91(6): 3253-3285.

Bound, J., Jaeger, D. A., & Baker, R. M. Problems with Instrumental Variables Estimation when the Correlation between the Instruments and the Endogenous Explanatory Variable is Weak. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 1995, 90(430): 443-450.

Callaway, B., & Sant'Anna, P. H. C. Difference-in-Differences with Multiple Time Periods. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2021, 225(2): 200-230.

Calonico, S., Cattaneo, M. D., & Titiunik, R. Robust Nonparametric Confidence Intervals for Regression-Discontinuity Designs. *Econometrica*, 2014, 82(6): 2295-2326.

Cantoni, D., & Yuchtman, N. Historical Natural Experiments: Bridging Economics and Economic History, in *Handbook of Historical Economics*, edited by A. Bisin and G. Federico, Academic Press, 2021: 213-241.

Card, D. The Impact of the Mariel Boatlift on the Miami Labor Market. *Industrial and Labor Relations Review*, 1990, 43(2): 245-257.

Card, D., & Krueger, A. Minimum Wages and Employment: A Case Study of the Fast Food Industry. *American Economic Review*, 1994, 84(4): 772-793.

Carvalho, C., Masini, R., & Medeiros, M. C. ArCo: An Artificial Counterfactual Approach for High-dimensional Panel Time-series Data. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2018, 207(2): 352-380.

Cattaneo, M. D., & Escanciano J. C., Introduction, Regression Discontinuity Designs: Theory and Applications, *Advances in Econometrics*, 2017, 38, ix-xxv.

Cattaneo, M. D., Feng, Y., & Titiunik, R. Prediction Intervals for Synthetic Control Methods. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2021, 116(536), 1865-1880.

Cattaneo, M. D., Frandsen, B., & Titiunik R. Randomization Inference in the Regression Discontinuity Design: An Application to Party Advantages in the U.S. Senate. *Journal of Causal Inference*, 2015, 3(1): 1-24.

Cattaneo, M. D., Jansson, M, & Ma, X. Simple Local Polynomial Density Estimators. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2020, 115(531): 1449-1455.

Cattaneo, M. D., Titiunik, R., & Vazquez-Bare, G. Comparing Inference Approaches for RD Designs: A Reexamination of the Effect of Head Start on Child Mortality. *Journal of Policy*

*Analysis and Management*, 2017, 36(3): 643-681.

Cengiz, D., Dube, A., Lindner, A., & Zipperer, B. The Effect of Minimum Wages on Low-Wage Jobs. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 2019, 134(3): 1405-1454.

Chen, Q., & Li, W. On the Sparsity of Synthetic Control Method. *Journal of Applied Economics*, 2024, 27(1): 2361184.

Chen, Q., Xiao, Z., & Yao, Q. Quantile Control via Random Forest. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2024, forthcoming.

Chen, Q., & Yan, G. A Mixed Placebo Test for Synthetic Control Method. *Economics Letters*, 2023, 224, 111004.

Chen, Y., Shi, S., & Tang, Y. 2019. Valuing the Urban Hukou in China: Evidence from a Regression Discontinuity Design for Housing Prices. *Journal of Development Economics*, 2019, 141: 102381.

Chernozhukov, V., Chetverikov, D., Demirer, M., Duflo, E., Hansen, C., Newey, W., & Robins, J. Double/debiased Machine Learning for Treatment and Structural Parameters. *Econometrics Journal*, 2018, 21(1): C1-C68.

Chernozhukov, V., Wüthrich, K., & Zhu, Y. An Exact and Robust Conformal Inference Method for Counterfactual and Synthetic Controls. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2021, 116(536): 1849-1864.

Christ, C. History of the Cowles Commission 1932-1952. In *Economic Theory and Measurement* (Chicago: Cowles Commission for Research in Economics, 1952), reprinted in *Econometrics, Macroeconomics and Economic Policy: Selected Papers of Carl Christ* (Oxford: Elgar, 1995).

Cook, T. D. “Waiting for Life to Arrive”: A History of the Regression-discontinuity Design in Psychology, Statistics and Economics. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2008, 142: 636-654.

de Chaisemartin, C., & D'Haultfœuille, X. Two-Way Fixed Effects Estimators with Heterogeneous Treatment Effects. *American Economic Review*, 2020, 110(9): 2964-96.

de Chaisemartin, C., & D'Haultfœuille, X. Difference-in-Differences Estimators of Intertemporal Treatment Effects. National Bureau of Economic Research, 2022, Working Paper Series 29873.

Fisher, R. A. *Statistical Methods for Research Workers*. Oxford, England: Oliver and Boyd, 1925.

Fisher, R. A. *The Design of Experiments*. Oxford, England: Oliver and Boyd, 1935.

Frisch, R. Editor's Note. *Econometrica*, 1933, 1(1): 1-4.

- Fuchs-Schündeln, N., Hassan, T. A. Natural Experiments in Macroeconomics, in *Handbook of Macroeconomics*, edited by J. B. Taylor and H. Uhlig, Elsevier, 2016, 2: 923-1012.
- Fujiki, H., & Hsiao, C. Disentangling the Effects of Multiple Treatments—Measuring the Net Economic Impact of the 1995 Great Hanshin-Awaji Earthquake. *Journal of Econometrics*, 186(1): 66-73.
- Gardner, J. 2021. Two-Stage Difference-in-Differences. Working Paper, 2021, [https://jrgcmu.github.io/2sdd\\_current.pdf](https://jrgcmu.github.io/2sdd_current.pdf).
- Glewwe, P., Kremer, M., & Moulin, S. Many Children Left Behind? Textbooks and Test Scores in Kenya. *American Economic Journal: Applied Economics*, 2009, 1(1): 112-135.
- Glewwe, P., Kremer, M., Moulin, S., & Zitzewitz, E. Retrospective vs. Prospective Analyses of School Inputs: The Case of Flip Charts in Kenya. *Journal of Development Economics*, 2004, 74(1): 251-268.
- Goodman-Bacon, A. Difference-in-differences with Variation in Treatment Timing. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2021, 225(2): 254-277.
- Gruber, J. The Incidence of Mandated Maternity Benefits. *American Economic Review*, 1994, 84(3): 622-41.
- Hahn, J., Todd, P., & Van der Klaauw, W. Identification and Estimation of Treatment Effects with a Regression-Discontinuity Design. *Econometrica*, 2001, 69(1): 201-209.
- Hansen, L. Large Sample Properties of Generalized Method of Moments Estimators. *Econometrica*, 1982, 50(4): 1029-1054.
- Heckman, J. J. Randomization and Social Policy Evaluation. In *Evaluating Welfare and Training Programs*, ed. C. Manski, I. Garfinkel, p. 201-230. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Univ. Press, 1992.
- Heckman, J. J. Causal Parameters and Policy Analysis in Economics: A Twentieth Century Retrospective. *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 2000, 115(1): 45-97.
- Heckman, J. J. Epilogue: Randomization and Social Policy Evaluation Revisited. In: *Randomized Control Trials in the Field of Development: A Critical Perspective*. Edited by: Florent Bédécarrats, Isabelle Guérin, and François Roubaud, Oxford University Press, 2020.
- Heckman, J. J., Ichimura, H., & Todd, P. E. Matching as an Econometric Evaluation Estimator: Evidence from Evaluating a Job Training Programme. *Review of Economic Studies*, 1997, 64(4): 605-654.

- Heckman, J. J., Ichimura, H., & Todd, P. E. Matching as an Econometric Evaluation Estimator. *Review of Economic Studies*, 1998, 65(2): 261-294.
- Holland, P. W. Statistics and Causal Inference. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*. 1986, 81(396): 945-960.
- Horvitz, D. G., & Thompson, D. J. A Generalization of Sampling Without Replacement from a Finite Universe. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 1952, 47(260): 663-685.
- Hsiao, C., Ching, S. H., & Wan, S. K. A Panel Data Approach for Program Evaluation: Measuring the Benefits of Political and Economic Integration of Hong Kong with Mainland China. *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 2012, 27: 705-740.
- Hsiao, C., & Zhou, Q. Panel Parametric, Semiparametric, and Nonparametric Construction of Counterfactuals. *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 2019, 34: 463-481.
- Imbens, G., & Angrist J. D. Identification and Estimation of Local Average Treatment Effects. *Econometrica*, 1994, 62(2): 467-475.
- Imbens, G., & Kalyanaraman, K. Optimal Bandwidth Choice for the Regression Discontinuity Estimator. *Review of Economic Studies*, 2012, 79: 933-959.
- Imbens, G., & Rubin, D. *Causal Inference for Statistical, Social and Biomedical Sciences: An Introduction*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2015.
- Imbens, G., & Wooldridge, J. Recent Developments in the Econometrics of Program Evaluation. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 2009, 47(1): 5–86.
- Jiang, W. Have Instrumental Variables Brought Us Closer to the Truth. *Review of Corporate Finance Studies*, 2017, 6 (2): 127-140.
- Keane, M., & Neal, T. Instrument Strength in IV Estimation and Inference: A Guide to Theory and Practice. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2023, 235: 1625-1653.
- Keynes, J. M. The League of Nations Professor Tinbergen's Method. *Economic Journal*, 1939, 49(195): 558-577.
- Lal, A., Lockhart, M., Xu, Y., & Zu, Z. How Much Should We Trust Instrumental Variable Estimates in Political Science? Practical Advice Based on 67 Replicated Studies. *Political Analysis*, published online, 2024:1-20.
- Leamer, E. E. Let's Take the Con Out of Econometrics. *American Economic Review*, 1983, 73(1): 31-43.

- Lee, D. S. Randomized Experiments from Non-random Selection in U.S. House Elections. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2008, 142(2): 675-697.
- Lee, D. S., McCrary, J., Moreira, M. J., & Porter, J. Instrument Strength in IV Estimation and Inference: A Guide to Theory and Practice. *American Economic Review*, 2022, 112(10): 3260-3290.
- Li, K. T., & Bell, D. R. Estimation of Average Treatment Effects with Panel Data: Asymptotic Theory and Implementation. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2017, 197(1): 65-75.
- Liu, T. Underidentification, Structural Estimation, and Forecasting. *Econometrica*, 1960, 28(4): 855-865.
- Liu, L., Wang, Y., & Xu, Y. A Practical Guide to Counterfactual Estimators for Causal Inference with Time-Series Cross-Sectional Data. *American Journal of Political Science*, 2024, 68: 160-176.
- McCrary, J. Manipulation of the Running Variable in the Regression Discontinuity Design: A Density Test. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2008, 142: 698-714.
- Meng, L. Evaluating China's Poverty Alleviation Program: A Regression Discontinuity Approach. *Journal of Public Economics*, 2013, 101: 1-11.
- Meyer, B. D. Natural and Quasi-Experiments in Economics. *Journal of Business & Economic Statistics*. 1995, 13(2): 151-161.
- Miguel, E., & Kremer, M. Worms: Identifying Impacts on Education and Health in the Presence of Treatment Externalities. *Econometrica*, 2004, 72(1): 159-217.
- Montiel Olea J., & Pflueger C. 2013. A Robust Test for Weak Instruments. *Journal of Business & Economic Statistics*, 2013, 31: 358-69.
- Neyman, J. On the Applicability of Probability Theory to Agricultural Experiments, 1923. Translated in *Statistical Science*, 1990, 5(4): 465-480.
- Olden, A., & Møen, J. The Triple Difference Estimator. *Econometrics Journal*, 2022, 25(3): 531-553.
- Qin, D. *The Formation of Econometrics: A Historical Perspective*. Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1993.
- Rambachan, A., & Roth, J. A More Credible Approach to Parallel Trends. *Review of Economic Studies*, 2023, 90(5): 2555-2591.

- Robins, J. M., Rotnitzky, A., & Zhao, L. P. Estimation of Regression Coefficients When Some Regressors are not Always Observed, *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 1994, 89(427): 846-866.
- Rosenbaum, P. R., & Rubin, D. B. The Central Role of the Propensity Score in Observational Studies for Causal Effects. *Biometrika*, 1983, 70(1): 41-55.
- Rosenzweig, M. R., & Wolpin, K. I. Natural “Natural Experiments” in Economics. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 2000, 38(4): 827-874.
- Roth, J., Sant’Anna, P. H. C., Bilinski, A., & Poe, J. What’s Trending in Difference-in-differences? A Synthesis of the Recent Econometrics Literature. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2023, 235(2): 2218-2244.
- Rubin, D. B. Estimating Causal Effects of Treatments in Randomized and Nonrandomized Studies. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 1974, 66: 688-701.
- Salsburg, D. *The Lady Tasting Tea: How Statistics Revolutionized Science in the Twentieth Century*. Holt Paperbacks, 2001.
- Sant’Anna, P. H. C., & Zhao, J. Doubly Robust Difference-in-differences Estimators. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2020, 219(1): 101-122.
- Sekhon, J. S., & Titiunik, R. When Natural Experiments Are Neither Natural nor Experiments. *American Political Science Review*, 2012, 106(1): 35-57.
- Snow, J. On the Mode of Communication of Cholera, 1855. In W. H. Frost (Ed.). *Snow on Cholera* (2nd ed.). New York: The Commonwealth Fund, 1936.
- Staiger, D., & Stock, J. H. Instrumental Variables Regression with Weak Instruments. *Econometrica*, 1997, 65(3): 557-586.
- Stock, J., & Trebbi, F. Who Invented Instrumental Variable Regression? *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 2003, 17(3): 177-194.
- Stock, J. H., & Yogo, M. Asymptotic Distributions of Instrumental Variables Statistics with Many Instruments. In *Identification and Inference for Econometric Models: Essays in Honor of Thomas Rothenberg*, edited by D. W. K. Andrews and J. H. Stock, 109-120. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
- Sun, L., & Abraham, S. Estimating Dynamic Treatment Effects in Event Studies with Heterogeneous Treatment Effects. *Journal of Econometrics*, 2021, 225(2): 175-199.

- Theil, H. *Repeated Least Squares Applied to Complete Equation Systems*. The Hague: Central Planning Bureau, 1953.
- Thistlethwaite, D., & Campbell, D. T. Regression-Discontinuity Analysis: An Alternative to the Ex Post Facto Experiment. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 1960, 51(2), 309-17.
- Tinbergen, J. A Method and its Application to Investment Activity. In *Statistical Testing of Business-Cycle Theories*. Geneva: League of Nations, 1939.
- Van Der Klaauw, W. Estimating the Effect of Financial Aid Offers on College Enrollment: A Regression-discontinuity Approach. *International Economic Review*, 2002, 43: 1249-1287.
- Vermeersch, C., & Kremer, M. School Meals, Educational Achievement and School Competition: Evidence from a Randomized Evaluation. *Policy Research Working Paper*, 2005, No. 3523, World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Wager, S., & Athey, S. Estimation and Inference of Heterogeneous Treatment Effects using Random Forests. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 2018, 113(523): 1228-1242.
- Wing, C., Yozwiak, M., Hollingsworth, A., Freedman, S., & Simon, K. Designing Difference-in-Difference Studies with Staggered Treatment Adoption: Key Concepts and Practical Guidelines, *Annual Review of Public Health*, 2024, 45: 485-505.
- Wooldridge, J. Two-Way Fixed Effects, the Two-Way Mundlak Regression, and Difference-in-Differences Estimators. Working paper, 2021.
- Wright, P. G. *The Tariff on Animal and Vegetable Oils*. New York: Macmillan, 1928.
- Yan, G., & Chen, Q. rcm: A Command for the Regression Control Method. *Stata Journal*, 2022, 22(4): 842-883.
- Yates, F. Sir Ronald Fisher and the Design of Experiments. *Biometrics*, 1964, 20(2): 307-321.